SMART PUNE
CREATION OF A VISION COMMUNITY

How Pune leveraged citizen engagement at scale to create a Vision Community?
We aimed to create a Vision Community to engage citizens in setting direction for a Smart Pune. Is it really possible for a Municipal Corporation to be humbled by its citizens? We were not sure. But we were in for a pleasant surprise…

A metropolitan city, which has reputation of being the ‘cultural capital’ and being ‘the Oxford of the East’, is faced with a constant challenge of preserving its legacy. That too, if it is as diverse as Pune, the task can become quiet challenging. Counted among the top 100 of the most populated cities in the world, Pune is an automobile and IT hub as well. Its pleasant weather and culturally tolerant citizens make it an ideal place for anyone to settle here for life. Two rivers, a dam, prominent worship centers for all religions, the Ganpati festival, palkhis, cultural fairs, various national research centers, expat hubs, renowned bazaars for traditional clothes, and glistening buildings of IT and software companies is what defines the identity of Pune. Pune is also known for Savitribai Phule, the first lady teacher in India, Lokmanya Tilak, freedom fighter and father of the Ganesh Festival, Yerawada Jail, IUCCA, and it’s various military establishments. In spite of being so diverse, Pune has preserved its cultural essence in its historic architecture, its numerous cultural events, and the tradition that is followed so diligently by all the citizens.

Recently, Pune has been ranked 145th among 440 cities around the world in terms of quality of living by the ‘Mercer 2015 Quality of Living survey’,
second only to Hyderabad (138th) in India. It was also listed as one among the 9 emerging cities around the world that are evolving as business centres.

Being the Municipal Corporation of such a great city, we have the responsibility to keep its legacy alive by not only ensuring that Pune hit the Smart City list, but also making it “The Ideal Smart City” in India. We set out with the objective of sensitizing our citizens about this initiative, considering it a monumental task, and got a pleasant surprise from our citizens instead.

Their enthusiasm and support, their level of involvement and initiation is inspiring. The Smart City Project Team went door to door to cover as many households as possible to distribute the Citizen Feedback Forms from the citizens and collect their feedbacks. Around 300 – 400 Ganesh Mandals have shown initiative to set up drop boxes for the devotees to submit their feedbacks. Around 15,000 school students from different schools in the city have taken out a rally to spread the word about the Smart Pune Mission. Such a response was unexpected and unprecedented!

It feels as if the Smart Pune initiative was orchestrated by us but owned by the society.
CONTEXT OF THE EFFORT
India will witness urbanization at a speed quite unlike anything it has seen before. As estimated by the McKinsey Global Institute, around 590 million people will live in cities by 2030, up from 340 million in 2008. Compared to this exponential growth, it took 40 years for India’s urban population to rise by 230 million between 1971 and 2008. In the next two to three decades, urbanization will be the most important growth engine, with cities driving more than 70 percent of new job creation and 70 percent of Indian GDP by 2030.

Indian cities are likely to house 40 percent of the Indian population by 2030

![Graph showing urbanization rate and population growth](image)

While urban development will be the most important growth engine for India, it will also put unprecedented pressure on resources and environment. With most cities planned many decades ago, unanticipated population explosion and rapid migration have seriously jeopardized their livability index. Most cities suffer from unending traffic jams, water shortages and challenges around waste disposal. As shown in figure below, the performance of Indian cities needs significant improvement across multiple parameters related to the “quality of life” (Source: McKinsey Global Institute).

Given this backdrop, the Smart Cities Mission initiated by the Government of India is particularly significant. Conceived as an innovative way to drive infrastructural, economic, environmental and social growth, the Smart Cities Mission aims to do so by enabling local development and harnessing technology to improve the quality of life of citizens.

The defining quality of a ‘smart city’ is one that puts people first.

With citizens as the main stakeholders and beneficiaries of the Smart Cities Mission, Pune city officials made an effort to involve ‘Punekars’ (Pune citizens) on an unprecedented scale.

This case study describes the citizen engagement effort in detail. It is divided into the following sections:

- Summary of the citizen engagement effort so far
- Preparation and planning before launching citizen engagement
- Emerging answers from the citizen engagement process
- Way forward for engagement of citizens

The current performance of India’s cities is poor across key indicators of quality of life

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Current</th>
<th>Basic service standard</th>
<th>Best-in-class</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Water supply quantity</td>
<td>Liters per capital per day</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>105</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Share of public transportation</td>
<td>%, total trips</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parks and open space</td>
<td>Square meters per capita</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.7</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>16.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sewage treated</td>
<td>%, sewage generated</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solid waste collected</td>
<td>%, total waste generated</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slum population</td>
<td>%, total population in cities</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: United Nations; press search; City development plans; The Energy and Resources Institute; Planning commission; Census 2001; Central Pollution Control Board; McKinsey Global Institute analysis
SUMMARY OF THE CITIZEN ENGAGEMENT EFFORT SO FAR
Before going into the citizen engagement process in detail, figure below describes the summary of the effort. The scale and the diversity of the effort have been unprecedented in reaching out to Punekars. In the first phase of the effort (the “visioning” phase), 50 percent of Pune households were covered through a very extensive offline and online campaign. All 17 wards were covered through a door-to-door campaign to educate the citizens about the Smart City Initiative and taking their vision about Smart Pune. Additionally, significant pull was created through media and online presence, where citizens went to the website to give their suggestions. All this was made possible through a 400 member team consisting of Pune Municipal Corporation (PMC) officials and multiple partners working 24x7. With the initial education of citizens and Subsequently, we worked on Phase II of citizen engagement, with inputs solicited from citizens on specific goals deduced from Phase I. By the time the citizen engagement process is completed, the scale of citizen engagement will have increased significantly, making the Pune citizen engagement effort perhaps the largest civic engagement effort in any city in the recent past.

### Summary of the Citizen Engagement effort so far

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PAN CITY INITIATIVE</th>
<th>AREA DEVELOPMENT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>ENVISION</strong> (17th -29th September)</td>
<td><strong>Area Survey</strong> (20th -26th October)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>DIAGNOSE</strong> (3rd -12th October)</td>
<td><strong>23,393</strong> Citizen decided (online/offline) <strong>the AREA to be developed</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>7.5 Lakh</strong> forms printed and distributed to house holds</td>
<td><strong>11 areas surveyed on 6 parameters</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1.04 Lakh</strong> Citizen gave input (online/offline) for <strong>GOALS prioritization</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>13.5 Lakh</strong> number of votes received to identify the goals from <strong>SIX PRIORITY SECTORS</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3 Lakh</strong> HH’s filled the form and data digitized to <strong>decide citizen’s VISION and identify the ISSUES</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>50%</strong> of total Pune households covered</td>
<td><strong>All 15</strong> wards covered by door-to-door campaigns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>All 15</strong> wards covered by door-to-door campaigns</td>
<td><strong>150,000</strong> people signed-up as smart volunteers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>INPUTS FROM CITIZENS</strong></td>
<td><strong>1,000,000</strong> more registrations on (<a href="http://www.punesmartcity.in">www.punesmartcity.in</a>) Pune Smart City web portal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>30 lakh</strong></td>
<td><strong>400</strong> member team running the initiative across private and public sectors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>All achieved in just 45 days</strong></td>
<td><strong>100</strong> Meetings with different sectors/groups</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Distinctive 5S approach towards citizen engagement

The ‘USP’ of Pune citizen engagement model was the holistic 5S approach

1. **Speed**: Ensuring the entire process from design to engagement to data analysis to solution development to syndication with citizens is completed in a 100 day timeline
2. **Scale**: Reach out to majority of citizens across all areas, across all socio-economic segments and demographics
3. **Structure**: Proprietary 9-phase approach to citizen engagement Pan-city and Local-area development
4. **Solutioning**: Focuses not only on identifying problems that need to be addressed, but also use crowd-sourcing and narrow-cast approach to develop real and implementable solutions
5. **Social audit**: Syndication with and acceptance of citizens part of core design
Any citizen engagement of this scale requires significant preparation and planning. The Smart City Pune team, which consisted of multi-stakeholders, such as Government Officials, Corporates, NGOs and Social Foundations, Consulting Firms, students from Schools and Colleges and local Media, drove a four-pronged effort before launching the citizen engagement Initiative, which consisted of:

- Defining the stages of citizen engagement and objectives for each stage
- Defining different modes of citizen engagement
- Creating a partner eco-system to drive an effort of this scale
- Creating a ‘war room’ to monitor and track the entire effort

Defining the stages of citizen engagement and objectives for each stage

In line with the Smart Cities Mission guidelines, The Pune Smart City team structured the entire citizen engagement effort into nine phases as outlined below. The first five phases were for the entire city while the last four were run for the area identified for the local area development initiative. The citizen engagement process was run tightly, with a strict deadline for each phase that was publicly announced. The output for each phase was shared back with the citizens with the help of local Media within two to three days, making it a closed-loop process.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase</th>
<th>Dates</th>
<th>Activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Phase – I</td>
<td>17th Sep – 28th Sep</td>
<td>Ask citizens on inputs on creating a vision for the city. Ask citizens the major areas of concern in the 12 sectors. Playback results at the end of the phase.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase – II</td>
<td>28th Sep – 12th Oct</td>
<td>Ask citizens about development opportunities and issues in each core sector and help identify the most vital issues that need to be resolved. Playback results at the end of the phase.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase – IV</td>
<td>Over a period of 3 days</td>
<td>Share the final set of solutions with citizens and open for suggestions and discussions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase – VI</td>
<td>26th Sep – 12th Oct</td>
<td>Participation of 50+ teams from arch. colleges in Pune. Extensive profiling done through walk through and workshops.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase – VII</td>
<td>Citizens asked issues they face in basic services. Vision for the area and the smart features it should have were understood.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phase – VIII</td>
<td>&gt;60% of the households to pledge support for the initiatives planned.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Details of the five phases for pan-city are given below:

- **Phase-0: Smart City Macro strategy Planning, (10 days)**
  The goal of this phase was to provide Framework for citizen engagement which also serves as the timeline guideline for rest of the proposal preparation.
  The following activities were conducted under this phase:
  - Creating a Grid for reaching out to various sections of the citizens in Pune and printing of 7,500,000 forms for them
  - Formulating a polling booth based connect strategy through PMC officials. Whereas the Pune Smart City Team trained the volunteers on the details of executing this strategy.
  - Setting up of Smart City Hoardings (500 were installed across the City of Pune)
  - The team, along with its Media Associates, conducted a meeting with the Ganesh Mandals of Pune. With a preparation time of only 4 days, we were successfully able to move the Ganesh Mandals through the city. Pune Municipal Corporation organized a meeting with members of various Mandals to seek their support in making Pune a Smart City. Such meetings were addressed directly by the Commissioner, PMC
  - Providing Broadcasting Support through Media Associates

- **Phase-I: Envision, 17th to 28th September**
  The goal of this phase was to collectively ENVISION a future for the city. The Pune Smart City team engaged with citizens at scale and asked them two questions
  - What is their city of the future?
  - What are the top three issues they would like to get addressed in this future city?
  5,75,000 forms were distributed out of which, a total of 2,67,990 forms were collected, that included 2,63,770 offline responses and 3,992 online responses.
  To ensure successful data collection and analysis on such a massive scale, a Smart Room (War Room) was set-up at PMC premises. The Smart Room objectives and overall strategy was pre-defined by the Pune smart City team, along with the work streams and the templates for daily work. The responses were digitized and recorded by the Response Management Team comprising smart city volunteers, PMC employees, college students, interns, NSS volunteers, partner organizations and others.
  The end-product of this phase was to create a citizen-driven ‘wordle’ or word cloud based on the frequency of words used by citizens to describe what they would like their future city to be and the top issues to be resolved.

---

**Summary of citizen engagement campaign planned**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mass citizen engagement</th>
<th>Media &amp; publicity campaigns</th>
<th>Citizen groups engagement</th>
<th>Engaging through digital channels</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Physical door-to-door form distribution</td>
<td>Competitions in English &amp; Marathi newspapers</td>
<td>Open house with citizens</td>
<td>Pune smart city portal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ganesh mandal events</td>
<td>Gallery walk to show case progress in the war room</td>
<td>Open forums with industry and trade</td>
<td>Pune smart city mobile app</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Enrolling smart volunteers</td>
<td>Radio and TV bites</td>
<td>Events for colleges and schools</td>
<td>Facebook page and Twitter handle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Slum visits and slum driveller interactions</td>
<td>Publicity at Ganesh Chaturthi celebrations</td>
<td>Discussions with NGOs and citizen groups</td>
<td>Online discussion and polling forums</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distribution of smartphones with APP to self-help groups</td>
<td>Citizen competitions – logo, slogan for Pune Smart City</td>
<td>Meetings with women activist groups</td>
<td>E-Seva Kendra’s and ward offices as campaign hubs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Phase-II: Diagnose, 28th September to 12th October

The goal of this phase was to DIAGNOSE the problems of Pune City across each of the core sectors with the help of citizens, and use this diagnosis to create specific goals to work towards making Pune a Smart City.

Data collected from the Envision phase was analyzed on demographic parameters such as area, gender, income level, profession, etc., and six key issues were identified. The Citizens were asked to prioritize specific goals in each sector of concern. For example, for water, which came as the second biggest issue, 10 specific goals were identified:

Diagnose phase – 10 specific goals identified for water

1. Equitable water distribution
2. Reduction in water leakage/wastage
3. Availability of water 24x7
4. Zero discharge of untreated water
5. Clean river/water bodies
6. Increased water recycling/reuse
7. Metered water supply
8. Control on unauthorized connections
9. Increase in per unit rates of water
10. Penalty for water misuse

Diagnose phase – The six priority sectors and specific goals

- **Transport and mobility (30%)**
  - Improvement in traffic discipline
  - Focus on accident reduction
  - Better parking facilities
  - Reduction in traffic congestion
  - Better public transport facilities
  - Encroachment free pathways
  - Better road network and connectivity
  - Promotion of bicycle and walking zones
  - Small distance public transport (e.g., Auto)

- **Water and sewage (25%)**
  - Control on unauthorized connections
  - Metered water supply
  - Increased water recycle/reuse
  - Clean river/water bodies
  - Zero discharge of untreated water
  - 24x7 water
  - Reduction in water leakage/wastage
  - Equitable water distribution
  - Increase in Water Rates

- **Solid waste management (22%)**
  - Improved transport of Waste
  - Citizens Participation in waste management
  - On call service for garbage pickup
  - Good garbage grievance addressal system
  - Increase recycling/reuse
  - Penalty for littering/spitting
  - Dustbins at public places
  - Regular & timely collection at door step
  - No dumping of garbage at landfill

- **Environment and sustainability (12%)**
  - Penalty for Polluters
  - Promotion of Green buildings
  - Recycling of waste
  - Clean roads and streets
  - More green cover in city
  - Zero discharge into river
  - Reduce Air Pollution
  - Reduced noise pollution
  - Environmental education to children

- **Safety and security (3%)**
  - Improve disaster management response
  - Effective means to counter terrorism
  - Greater road safety measures
  - Protection of facilities and organizations
  - Evacuation plans for emergencies
  - Faster & integrated emergency response
  - Safety for Women, Child & Sr. Citizen
  - Better surveillance to reduce crime
  - Improved lighting at public places

- **Energy (2%)**
  - Innovative ideas for conservation
  - Promotion of Energy Efficiency
  - LED street lightning
  - Promotion of energy efficient equipment
  - Increased use of renewable energy
  - Reliable power quality and services
  - Less power cuts and outages
  - Less wastage of electricity
  - Establishment of Smart Grid
Citizens then voted to identify the most critical goals for the city.

- **Phase – III: Co-Create, 13th October to 23rd October**

In this phase, the PMC and citizens CO-CREATED the solutions to realize the goals identified. The major issue areas and definite goals within were thrown open to the public and solutions invited through a discussion forum. Citizens were encouraged to come up with smart and intelligent solutions in their areas of concern. Summarizing the survey, the top concerns and issues were categorized and sent out to experts for generating and refining solutions.

**Co-Create phase – Summary of output**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Solution Area</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transportation and Mobility</td>
<td>43.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water and Sewage</td>
<td>15.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Solid Waste Management</td>
<td>14.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Safety and Security</td>
<td>12.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment and Sustainability</td>
<td>9.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Energy</td>
<td>5.6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Top 3 solutions in Solid Waste Management**

1. **Vinay Vaswani**
   - “Recycling e-Waste”
   - “As we can see, the partial ban on plastic bags is not working with vegetable vendors and others flouting the ban at will, only a complete ban on the usage of plastic bags will help.
   - Designate 1 day of month for collection of e-waste or keep fixed locations in city for citizens to drop their e-waste.
   - Awareness of waste segregation and colour coding
   - Have competitions among housing societies and declare small awards for cleanest societies/localities and even awards for ward officers whose wards are the cleanest.”

2. **Arup K. Gangopadhyay**
   - “Use e-governance & digitization”
   - “First is garbage management and sanitation. This takes care of environment, health and slum problems automatically. Second, regular/uniform water and electricity supply. This will enhance e-education, e-policing, e-governance, e-traffic and crime management along with IT connectivity/digitization, safety and security. This also complements environment automatically. Finally, traffic and transport should be fully managed electronically as we already have the necessary infra like CCTV cameras almost ready”

3. **Devdas Jadhav**
   - “Conduct Anti-litter campaigns”
   - “PMC should run a number of anti-litter campaigns to encourage people to use toilets”

**Bubble Chart**

- Size of the Bubble: Capital Investment (L, M, H)
- Complexity
- Business Value

1. Installation of sound detector and digital message board
2. Pune Traffic should be active on Social Media
3. Conduct Water Conservation Campaigns
4. Recycling e-Waste
5. Use of e-Governance & digitization
7. Create Crime map of the city
8. Recycling of plastic for road construction
9. Reinforce safe movements for all users, both motorized and non-motorized
10. Public transport at regular intervals
11. Regular inspection of water leakage
12. Build canals to store rain water
13. Conduct Anti-litter campaigns
14. Conduct Evacuation training programs
15. Develop dead-lands into parks
16. Replace diesel/petrol with CNG/electric vehicles
17. Increase use of Solar and Biogas Energy
18. Installations of windmills around the city
19. Conduct Energy Audit
• Phase – IV: Refine

Two day-long mini-labs were conducted with elected representatives and citizens for the 3 priority sectors to refine solutions.

Elected representatives (corporators) and citizens were invited to work with PMC to refine the solutions developed in each of the sectors.

Snapshot from refine phase

Traffic Workshop

Water Workshop

SWM and Sanitation Workshop
• Phase – V: Share, 24th October to 24th November

The PMC SHARED the sector-wise solutions with citizens after collating and analyzing data with the help of local and global experts from respective sectors. Through focus group discussions and workshops additionally, having involved the citizens at every stage of proposal development, we started a campaign to get citizens’ support for the Smart City Proposal. The idea was to get citizens to undertake the “Smart City Pledge” to share Pune’s plan for development of smart city before the citizens, to ensure the citizens are aware of the developments which will be made in the future, what will be the impact of the development and what are the implementation requirements.

Online pledge

I, citizen of Pune want to make Pune the smartest City of India. Our vision is to make Pune the most liveable City, with great quality of life, ample resources and opportunities for all Punekars. I understand that the journey towards becoming a smart City will require active participation from us in the future. I commit to be the driver of this change in my own respective ways. I pledge to take up responsibilities that the City may require us to undertake in this journey. I together with the City Corporation will strive to improve and maintain the infrastructure in the city, starting with the most pressing problems of transport, water, and waste management. I would help develop model areas and replicate them across the City. This way I not only intend to set an example in front the country, but also to the entire world. I hereby affirm my sincere support to our City’s Smart City Proposal, which captures the hopes and aspirations of all of us through probably the largest ever citizen engagement program in the history of the urban world.

Support Pune’s Smart City Proposal through this Signature Campaign.
Visioning and Selection of Local-area for Development
A comprehensive citizen engagement process was run for local area selection, with 2.81 lakh inputs for the area selection based on the criteria shared by the PMC. Citizen selection process, along with the discussions with the urban planners and elected representatives formed the basis for very objective local area selection.

- **Phase 1 – Area evaluation and selection:**
  In this phase, 6 steps were followed to shortlist, evaluate and select area for local area development:

  1. **Selection of development type:** Between the option of Greenfield, Redevelopment and Retrofit - Greenfield as unfeasible no continuous area of 500 acres is available in PMC limits (as required by smart city mission), similarly no continuous area of 50 acres was available for redevelopment. Retrofit was selected because of feasible and ease of replicability across Pune.

  2. **Define assessment criteria for selection:** Based on discussion with city engineers, sector experts and architects, a 10 point assessment criteria was created to profile areas

  3. **Short-listing of areas:** 11 continuous 500 acre areas were shortlisted based on ward data analysis and focus group discussions with urban planners

  4. **Evaluation by citizen engagement:** 23,393 citizens were engaged over 6 days and provided 2.81 lakh inputs which formed the basis for regional assessment, Aundh-Baner-Balewadi (ABB) was the choice

  5. **Evaluation by sector experts:** Expert panel evaluated each of the shortlisted areas, ABB was the choice – scoring highest points

  6. **Evaluation by elected representatives:** Municipal Commissioner of Pune engaged with 40 elected representatives across all political parties over 3 days and common consensus was achieved for ABB

- **Phase 2 – Area-based competitions and profiling:** 50+ teams from architecture colleges across Pune participated in the ABB local area development competition and did extensive profiling of the area through walkthroughs and workshops

- **Phase 3 – Engagement with residents of ABB:** Extensive citizen engagement was done for 10,194 citizens with 2.14 lakh inputs (60% of total ABB households) and citizens were asked the issues in basic services they face and further their vision of the area and the smart features that it should have

- **Phase 4 – Sharing and acceptance:** Final proposal is being shared with the citizens before and citizens are pledging acceptance of the solutions and the Smart City proposal, goal is to reach >60% of households of ABB
DEFINING DIFFERENT MODES OF CITIZEN ENGAGEMENT
Different modes of citizen engagement are as important as the entire process, since the right methods of engagement will ensure maximum citizen participation. Team Pune identified five main methods of citizen engagement, with various interventions in each method:

A. Face-to-face
   1. Door-to-door visits by PMC employees and volunteers to get forms filled
   2. Camps in schools, colleges, companies and organizations
   3. Mass form distribution in societies/townships
   4. Form filling booths in government offices across the city
   5. Paper forms and smart phones distribution in Ganesh Mandals during Ganesh Chaturthi

B. Digital and online
   1. Pune smart city web portal—punesmartcity.in
   2. Gamification – reward system for participation through website
   3. Public computer terminals to access portal at e-seva kendras and ward offices across the city
   4. Computer labs in schools and colleges opened to citizens
   5. Twitter handles and Facebook page
   6. Android app for smart phones

C. Open houses and events
   1. Essay, logo and mascot design competition in English and Marathi newspapers
   2. Area development competition for architecture colleges students
   3. Digital ‘Hackathon’ conducted across 60 engineering colleges
   4. ‘Smart family’ and ‘Smart citizen’ initiatives

D. Competitions for crowdsourcing of ideas and creativity
   1. Essay, logo and mascot design competition in English and Marathi newspapers
   2. Area development competition for architecture colleges students
   3. Digital ‘Hackathon’ conducted across 60 engineering colleges
   4. ‘Smart family’ and ‘Smart citizen’ initiatives

E. Publicity and advertising
   1. Hoardings and banners
   2. Soundbites on radio channels
   3. Interviews, panel discussions, press meets on TV and radio
   4. ‘Gallery walk’ setup in the War Room to make citizens aware of Smart City initiative
Extent of coverage of citizen engagement in different media and channels

**Offline**

1. **Face-to-face:** 7.5 lakh forms distributed to households across all 15 wards, out of which, 307,991 households filled the form
   - 1.5 lakh citizens signed-up as smart volunteers

2. **Discussions:** 100+ meetings with different groups from the Pune stakeholder grid

3. **Newspapers:** 10 leading newspapers in the city covered the campaign through 20 articles over a period of 45 days

4. **Radio-channels:** 40 messages broadcasted across 5 radio channels

**Online**

1. **Portal:** 70,778 registrations on Pune Smart City portal within 1 month

2. **Facebook:** 29,860 digital audience along with 1,435 likes, 423 posts made and 289 shares of the broadcasted messages

3. **Twitter:** 1,168,312 impressions and reach of 670,506 through 3,585 tweets and 6,345 retweets in 2 months

4. **Mobile app:** 6,700+ responses with 1,092 downloads and ~500 ideas received from citizens

5. **Youtube:** Broadcasts received 21,767 views and 3,951 likes
Modes of citizen engagement

- **Door-to-door form distribution and filling**
- **Form collection at ward offices**
- **Banners and hoardings at public places**
- **Training sessions of municipal and ward teams**
- **Engaging with citizen groups, organizations and associations**
The scale of engagement envisioned by the Pune Municipal Corporation required support from various quarters. A deliberate strategy was to create an eco-system of partners who could help the PMC in this massive citizen engagement effort. The eco-system created for this effort is detailed.
CREATING A WAR ROOM (SMART ROOM) TO TRACK THE ENTIRE EFFORT
The Pune Smart City team set up a War Room to run the entire citizen engagement effort 24x7. The War Room has been divided into six cells to drive the citizen engagement process end-to-end. The detailed activities of each of these cells are discussed below:

A. Campaign and Activity Management Cell

Responsibilities of the Campaign and Activity Management Cell include

1. Organizing any public event or activity as a part of the Citizen Engagement campaign, with support from any other cell if required
2. Ensuring ATL activities are pushed to broadcast mechanism (PRO, PMC) so that the event or the activity gets maximum reach among citizens
3. Working and updating the other management cells so they can plan future activities based on present activities and provide data from the activity to the response management cell
4. Managing broadcast of content and coordinate with media including TV, print and radio, online websites and blogs
5. Managing hoardings and putting up of banners across the city

B. Response Management Cell

Responsibilities of the response management cell include

1. Managing distribution of paper forms across all channels
2. Training of volunteers and municipality involved in the form distribution and collection process
3. Ensuring that the data received from the citizens is legible
4. Managing responses from other modes of communication (for example, the PMC website) and sending forward for analysis
5. Conducting and managing data entry exercise of paper forms
6. Providing data on a day-to-day basis to the Analytics Management Cell for its detailed examination
7. Collating and curating data received from citizens after the process of data entry is completed
8. Once collected, the hard copies of the data being used are first curated, collated and then sent forward for analysis

C. Analytics Cell

Responsibilities of the analytics cell include

1. Interpreting data, analyzing results using statistical techniques and providing ongoing reports
2. Developing and implementing data collection systems and other strategies that optimize statistical efficiency and data quality
3. Acquiring data from the Response Management Cell and maintaining databases/data systems
4. Identifying, analyzing, and interpreting trends or patterns in complex data sets
5. Filtering and ‘cleaning’ data, and reviewing computer reports, printouts, and performance indicators
6. Working closely with the management to prioritize information needs
7. Locating and defining new process improvement opportunities

D. Creative Management Cell

Responsibilities of the creative cell include

1. Creating content for official communications from the PMC to citizens regarding the Smart City initiative
2. Designing and creating offline content in terms of content for letters, emails, banners, standees and posters for the Smart City campaign
3. Designing and creating social media content on Facebook and Twitter. Content for the website for all the phases will be made available in English and Marathi
4. Setting up a ‘Gallery Walk’ that creates a great visual within the War Room with banners, posters, videos, photographs and other graphics that can be used to inform and engage citizens and create awareness of the initiatives
E. Documentation Management Cell

The activities throughout the citizen engagement process are being documented by the Documentation Cell. This has been mandated by the Ministry of Urban Development (MoUD) and the proposal submitted will be considered incomplete without this documentation.

Responsibilities of the Documentation Management Cell include:

1. Maintaining proof and record of: Broadcast Reach and Inclusion, Response Quantity and Response Inclusion Proof in the final proposal
2. Documentation of all activities undertaken by the other cells and the PMC under the citizen engagement plan
3. Providing all the documented inputs to the core team, crack teams and mini lab teams on a weekly basis

The final deliverable of the cell will include structured documentation of the following:

a. Methods/extent and Inclusion of each round of the Campaign
b. Responses from people generated
c. Responses included in the final plan
d. Maintaining the Data Repository

Pune Smart City war room in pictures
**Emerging answers from the citizen engagement process**

**Envision Phase Output**

Based on the inputs of citizens, a word cloud or ‘wordle’ was created to identify what citizens would like to see in the city of Pune.

The team also granularly mapped out the top responses for each area, which were very handy in the local area development effort.

**Example of area-wise response**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pin Code</th>
<th>Area name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>411006</td>
<td>Yervada S.O. and Yervada T.S.S.O.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>411014</td>
<td>9 DRD B.O. Dukirkline S.O. Vadgaon Sheri S.O. and Viman Nagar S.O.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>411028</td>
<td>Hadapsar S.O. Sasane nagar S.O. and Gondhale Nagar S.O.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>411037</td>
<td>Bibewadi S.O. Salisbury Park S.O. and Yerwada T.S.S.O.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>411038</td>
<td>Kothrud S.O. Bhusari Colony S.O. and Ex. Serviceman Colony S.O.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Additionally, a citizen-driven word cloud was created for top issues.
As in the case of vision, area-wise top issues were identified, which helped us prioritize their redressal in the proposal.

**Summary of area-wise issues identified**

Note: Obtained from citizen engagement exercise with ~50% Pune households
Diagnosis Phase Output

In the diagnosis phase, the city received overwhelming response on specific goals within the prioritized sectors.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top 5 goals within the prioritised sectors</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>TRANSPORT AND MOBILITY</strong></td>
<td><strong>WATER AND SEWAGE</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>48% Better public transport facilities</td>
<td>42% Clean river/water bodies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43% Improvement in traffic discipline</td>
<td>37% Reduction in water leakage/wastage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43% Better parking facilities</td>
<td>36% Increased water recycle/reuse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>43% Reduction in traffic congestion</td>
<td>34% Zero discharge of untreated water</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37% Encroachment free pathways</td>
<td>33% Metered water supply</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT</strong></td>
<td><strong>ENVIRONMENT AND SUSTAINABILITY</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39% Penalty for littering/spitting</td>
<td>41% Clean roads and streets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>38% Increase recycling/reuse</td>
<td>40% Recycling of waste</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36% Citizens Participation in waste management</td>
<td>39% More green cover in city</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35% Dustbins at public places</td>
<td>39% Zero discharge into river</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34% On call service for garbage pickup</td>
<td>39% Reduce air pollution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SAFETY AND SECURITY</strong></td>
<td><strong>ENERGY</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>39% Greater road safety measures</td>
<td>41% LED street lighting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37% Safety for Women, Child and Sr. Citizen</td>
<td>34% Increased use of renewable energy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34% Effective means to counter terrorism</td>
<td>33% Less power cuts and outages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32% Faster and integrated emergency response</td>
<td>32% Promotion of energy efficient equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31% Better evacuation plans for emergencies</td>
<td>32% Promotion of energy efficiency</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Co-create Phase Output

In this phase, citizens were encouraged to provide solutions to the top goals they identified for Pune. Along with submitting new ideas, citizens could support other’s ideas by liking/sharing them and building on others ideas. For this phase, we developed an interactive platform which could provide these features to citizens with minimal effort.

~10,000 ideas were contributed by citizens in this phase.

### Top goals for which solutions were requested

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TRANSPORT AND MOBILITY</th>
<th>WATER AND SEWAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Citizens priorities</td>
<td>Citizens priorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better public transport facilities</td>
<td>Focus on accident reduction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduction in traffic congestion</td>
<td>Better road network and connectivity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Better parking facilities</td>
<td>Encroachment free pathways</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JOIN DISCUSSION</td>
<td>JOIN DISCUSSION</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SOLID WASTE MANAGEMENT</th>
<th>ENVIRONMENT AND SUSTAINABILITY</th>
<th>ENERGY</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Citizens priorities</td>
<td>Citizens priorities</td>
<td>Citizens priorities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Penalty for littering/ spitting</td>
<td>Good garbage grievance addressal system</td>
<td>LED street lighting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase recycling/ reuse</td>
<td>On call service for garbage pickup</td>
<td>Less power cuts and outages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dustbins at public places</td>
<td>Citizens Participation in waste management</td>
<td>Promotion of energy efficient equipment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Promotion of energy efficiency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JOIN DISCUSSION</td>
<td>JOIN DISCUSSION</td>
<td>JOIN DISCUSSION</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

|                         |                              |
| WATER AND SEWAGE       |                              |
| Citizens priorities    |                              |
| Zero discharge of untreated water | Reduction in water leakage/wastage |
| 24x7 water             | Increased water recycle/reuse |
| Clean river/water bodies | Metered water supply |
|                         |                              |
| JOIN DISCUSSION         |                              |

| ENVIRONMENT AND SUSTAINABILITY | ENERGY |
| Citizens priorities            | Citizens priorities |
| Clean roads and streets        | LED street lighting |
| More green cover in city       | Less power cuts and outages |
| Recycling of waste             | Promotion of energy efficient equipment |
| Zero discharge into river      | Promotion of energy efficiency |
|                               | Increased use of renewable energy |
|                               | Reliable power quality and services |
| JOIN DISCUSSION                | JOIN DISCUSSION             |
Local Area Development

Pune reached another milestone in co-creating a smart city when the entire city came together to collectively select one area to develop as the model smart area to be replicated across Pune. The entire campaign was exhaustive with the following necessary elements:

**Six questions asked to citizens to give their priorities**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Question</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Area most important for identity of Pune?</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Area you would like to live in?</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Area you would like to invest in as an entrepreneur?</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Youth’s recreational hub in Pune?</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Area which will benefit a larger cross section of society?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Recreational hub of Pune?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Points based ranking of the eleven areas surveyed**

Maximum points awarded to “Aundh, Baner & Balewadi” area

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>Points</th>
<th>Rank</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aundh, Baner and Balewadi</td>
<td>63</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core city area</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>College area (FC road to Karve road)</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kharadi</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sinhagad road area (Dandekar Pul)</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karvenagar</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hadapsar – Market area</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>River bank (Lakadi Pul to Nava Pul)</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dhankawadi – Ambegaon</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sahakarnagar</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yerawada</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Citizens marked “Aundh, Baner and Balewadi” at a top priority in three out of six questions!

**Methodology**

- For each question, points were assigned from 1 to 11 for all the 11 available area options where 11 was assigned to the area with the maximum votes for that question and 1 was assigned to the area with the minimum votes.
- Across all questions, for each area, summation of votes was done to arrive at a cumulative point value for the area.
- Individual areas were ranked on the basis of the assigned points.

**Top five smart city features that are missing and should be developed**


- Water Supply: 45%
- Citizen Participation: 40%
- Health: 35%
- Waste Water Management: 35%
- Waste Management: 36%

Total responses: 10,194

29.5% Women

70.5% Men
Closing and the way forward for Pune

Pune’s Citizen engagement success story has been covered in Urbana India, IEEE forum, Ministry of IT by CDAC, Idea camp organized by Bloomberg under Ministry of Urban Development, Government of India, 50 brochures distributed and presented in Barcelona Smart City Expo and the World Smart City Forum, Brussels.

Pune is poised to propel its way into becoming a truly ‘smart city’, following a process driven by its citizens. To ensure successful implementation of the proposed solutions for Smart City Pune Initiative, not just the PMC but also the citizens will monitor and track the entire effort. Till date, we have the full commitment by 7 lakh households form Pune to follow up on the progress for the next ten years. Various local media houses also, have committed to report and publish the progress on regular basis in newspapers, radio shows and TV.

Through this effort, we have created a strong Vision Community in Pune where every citizen experiences opportunities to voice his/her opinion and help implement solutions to the issues of the community.

Pune, as one of the world’s most liveable, economically vibrant, inclusive and environmentally sustainable city is now in sight.

This kind of ownership by citizens makes this effort a true success story
Annexure

Pune city’s partners in the Smart City initiative

• **NGOs**
  - **Delivering Change Foundation** – Delivering Change Foundation (DCF) is an independent organization that partners with governments and communities to accomplish transformation in public services
  - **Janwani** – Works for the city on livability and quality of life topics using city-centred and collaborative approach
  - **Parasar Asha** – A registered Trust and NGO working since 1990 to improve city services and boost environment friendly initiatives

• **Technology Partners**
  - **Zensar Technologies** – Pune based company large IT company that works on several public and government projects
  - **Persistent Systems** – Pune based company large IT company that works on several public and government projects
  - **Aikon Labs Pvt. Ltd.** – Aikon Labs is a start-up focused on Helping Realize Ideas and boost innovation through community platforms and idea management systems
  - **CDAC** – Centre for Development of Advanced Computing is a premier R&D organization of the Department of Electronics and Information Technology (DeitY), Ministry of Communications & Information Technology (MCIT)

• **Universities and Colleges**
  - **Symbiosis Centre for Management & Human Resource Development (SCMHRD)** – Established in 1993, SCMHRD’s MBA program is one of the most prestigious programs in India
  - **Savitribai Phule Pune University** – One of the premier universities in India and houses 46 academic departments and has about 307 recognized research institutes and 612 affiliated colleges offering graduate and under-graduate courses

• **Citizen Organizations**
  - **Pune International Centre** – It was formed with a view to create a meeting point for great minds, where enlightened discussions and debates could be held about the future of Pune, India and the world. Over 300 eminent personalities from Pune have now joined as Founders of PIC
  - **Prayas Energy Group** – Prayas is a non-governmental, non-profit organization based in Pune, India. Members of Prayas are professionals working to protect and promote public interest in general, and interests of the disadvantaged sections of the society, in particular
  - **India Development Foundation of Overseas Indians** – It is a not-for-profit trust registered by the Ministry of Overseas Indian Affairs, Government of India to provide a credible window for Overseas Indian Philanthropy in India’s Social Development

• **Industry Associations**
  - **MCCIA** – The Maratha Chambers of Commerce, Industry and Agriculture is an industry association that has been playing a significant role in accelerating the industrial and economic development of Pune region for more than seven decades now
  - **CII** – One of the foremost industry associations in India with strong presence and membership from Pune
  - **FICCI** – One of the foremost industry associations in India with strong presence and membership from Pune
7.5 Lakh forms are being distributed and ward teams reached door-to-door to get forms filled; e-Seva Kendra’s and ward offices supported citizens to access the online portal

- All 17 wards have been covered and form distribution and collection is in progress
- 7.5 lakh Phase-I forms have been printed and being distributed
- Teams in each ward are going door-to-door to get forms filled
- e-Seva Kendra’s staff been trained to assist citizens to log-on and post opinion
- E-Seva Kendra’s are acting as hubs for citizens to access online portals
- Ward offices will be used to digitize data

Water example: 16 subject experts and 14 companies were engaged to find solutions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Reservoir building</th>
<th>Smart metering</th>
<th>Infra and technology</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gondwana Engineers Limited</td>
<td>Sensus</td>
<td>Esri</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WABAC</td>
<td>Kamstrup</td>
<td>SPML Engineering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SFC Group</td>
<td>ARAD Technologies</td>
<td>Infra</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Veolia</td>
<td>Danfoss</td>
<td>Siemens</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24x7 Water Solutions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
24x7 war room to run the citizen engagement campaign

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Input</th>
<th>Output</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Data collection</td>
<td>Analysis</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **What are we doing**
- **Why Pune leads other cities**
- **What is a smart city, About Smart City mission**
- **Photo gallery, campaign news clippings**
- **Pune Smart City war room details**
- **Entry into the war room**
- **Banners**