Inclusive Design for Street Vendors in India

Centre for Urban Equity (CUE)
CEPT University
Ahmedabad
Contents

1. Introduction 3
2. Issues and Challenges 4
3. Design Process 6
4. Design Parameters 8
5. Urban Design Innovations 12
6. Planning Innovations 18

Appendix: Design & the Law 25

©Centre for Urban Equity & Cardiff University - 2014

With Cardiff University
Prepared under an ESRC/DFID funded research programme entitled Making Space for the Poor: Law, Rights, Regulation and Street Trade in the 21st Century.

Contributors
Prof. Darshini Mahadevia, Prof. Alison Brown, Suchita Vayas, Tejas Patel and Self Employed Women’s Association (SEWA)

Disclaimer
The comments and opinions in this paper are of the author(s) and not of the Centre for Urban Equity or CEPT University.
1. Introduction

For generations, street vending has provided vibrancy, colour and a market outlet in Indian cities. However, as the 21st century progresses, the dynamic growth of city populations, the scale of physical development, and globalising economies create new challenges for street vendors, who face changing political, economic and social contexts and increasing competition for space.

Today, modern street vending plays a vital role in the urban economy, as a source of jobs, revenue and ‘value added’ to the economy. Street vending provides a flexible link in economic supply chains, gives vitality to urban streets, and provides affordable goods for many urban residents. Yet street vending exacerbates congestion at busy sites (eg: city centres where competition for space is acute) and vendors lack the facilities for ‘decent work’.

This Design Guide explores the challenges of managing street vending in modern India, and explores how inclusive urban design can generate imaginative use of space. The Design Guide adopts a ‘rights-based approach’ to development, building on the paradigm of the right to the city, which argues for a right for all urban inhabitants to access the benefits of urban life, including street vendors. The guide draws on work undertaken by the Centre for Urban Equity at CEPT University, and is part of the ESRC/DFID research programme entitled Making Space for the Poor: Law, Rights, Regulation and Street Trade in the 21st Century, run by Cardiff University.

---

1 ESRC/DFID Award RES-167-25-0591
2. Issues and Challenges

Opportunities of street vending

Street vending provides many opportunities: goods and services at convenient locations, and affordable prices; self-employment for large numbers of people; links formal sector with clients; keeps streets clean, busy and safe, creates an interesting city environment.

Interesting city environment

Employment for many people

Keeps street busy

Outlet for formal sector goods

Provides affordable goods

Goods available at convenient locations
Problems for street vendors

Lack of space (eg: surfaced pavements and secure vending sites) and lack of facilities (eg: shelter, street drainage, water and toilets, or storage) cause major problems for vendors.

Problems for other street users

Vending also takes up street space, blocking pavement and parking space and causing congestion for other road users.
3. Design Process

Participatory design

Street vendors have innovative ideas of how space conflicts can be resolved, and when secured vending space is assured many vendor associations can manage the vending space. Management may include, space allocation, collection of fees or license payments, and cleaning and litter collection.
**Context analysis**

The context analysis explores the role of the market in its wider area, looking at:

- Surrounding land uses (including generators of pedestrian traffic)
- Existing access for pedestrians, autorickshaws, motorcycles, cars and market goods
- Nearby landmarks that draw people to the area
- Type of market, eg: city level, area level, roadside, bus stand etc
- Main goods sold: daily (eg: vegetables, perishables), consumer goods (eg: clothes, household, etc.)
- Understand the linkages (supplies, customers, role in urban retail hierarchy)

**Mapping the existing situation**

Detailed market mapping is crucial, because often official planning processes do not show what is happening informally, and thus there is no documented information on the scale and size of vending activities. Market mapping is best undertaken with or by vendor associations, who understand the daily and weekly fluctuation of trade. The mapping should consider: numbers of vendors at different times; types of goods sold; location of facilities, eg: toilets, taps. Any redesign or rearrangement of space should accommodate all existing vendors, otherwise those excluded will suffer increased hardship and poverty.
4. Design Parameters

Display space for different vending activities

These sketches show some of the most common forms of vending display in Ahmedabad. A characteristic of street vending in India, less common elsewhere, is the widespread use of the lari (cart) for display and moving goods.

1) Balloon man

2) No storage and structure for vending on ground (display space 1.8 X1.2 m)

3) Using compound wall as to display clothes'

4) Small space required with platform selling flowers

5) Platform created with boxes, height is modified as per need

6) Temporary structure required with platform for bread seller

7) Selling fruits on moving cart with temporary weather protection (display space 1.8 X 1.05 m)

8) Cots and beds used to display goods by old clothes' vendors (display space 2 X 1m)

9) Designed moving cart

10) Designed moving cart to sell ice-cream

Study of street vending, Ahmedabad, 2011, CUE
Street space requirements

The sketches below show minimum cross-sections of streets used for vending if no obstructions occur. Pavement widths of 2.0m-2.5m allow two people to pass. Seated vendors with a stall or stand usually require a further 2.0m to display their goods.

Broad pavement

Narrow pavement

Temporary vending areas

Design Parameters...ctd.

Type of market or street vending area

The type of market or street vending area, and the space requirements, also depends on its function within the city retailing hierarchy, the type of goods sold - whether general or specialist, and the times of operation. Each market or street vending area has its own characteristics, but four broad types of market can be identified:

- **City market** - selling specialist clothes or goods;
- **Neighbourhood market** - selling day-to-day goods, such as vegetables, meat, or bread;
- **Street market** - serving passing trade, eg: with cooked food, vegetables, etc.;
- **Hub market** - at busy pedestrian locations, eg: a transport node, religious place, or hospital;

In addition there are many specialist markets, eg: selling flowers or used clothes. Temporary markets or vending areas may take place on specific days of the week. Festival markets take place at specific times of year.

Natural markets

SEWA\(^2\), which represents 1 million self-employed workers, has developed the concept of a ‘natural market’, a place with particular potential for street vending because of its high pedestrian flows. This may be a city centre site, a bus terminal, a religious building or an important road junction. SEWA has undertaken a study identifying 165 street markets in Ahmedabad\(^3\). It is often difficult to relocate vendors from natural markets, but important to resolve the conflicts that are common at such sites.
## Goods sold and time of operation

Different types of markets in Ahmedabad:
Study of location, type of vending and display, and time period

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Goods</th>
<th>Timing</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>City centre/specialist market</td>
<td>Used clothes</td>
<td>Morning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neighbourhood market</td>
<td>Vegetables/cooked food</td>
<td>Afternoon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Street market</td>
<td>New clothes, evening market</td>
<td>Evening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hub market/public leisure garden</td>
<td>Cooked food</td>
<td>Night</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
5. Urban Design Innovations

Pavements

Inclusive design often means making the best use of existing space through better space management or time-sharing (eg: for an evening or Sunday market). The sketches below show different ways in which a 4m pavement width can accommodate vending, with or without fixed structures.

[Lari with shade umbrella and seating area, eg: for vegetables or household goods]

[Lockable storage, display shelves and sun/rain shade, eg: for phone accessories]

[Cooked food display with seating area, shade, and storage space for utensils and ingredients, eg: for roti]
Small mobile cart on platform, eg: for selling *chai*

Moveable seat, display boxes and umbrella, eg: for vegetable seller

Wall and floor display with fixed shelter, eg: for T-shirts

Moveable seat and umbrella, eg: for shoe-mender
Urban Design Innovations...ctd.

Road space

The following sketches are based on a street market in Ahmedabad, to show how unorganised trading in a service lane could be rearranged to allow for better space sharing, to reduce the conflict between vendors, vehicles and pedestrians.

Analysis of a street market in Ahmedabad shows how vending spaces can be better arranged

Types of vending activity

- Shoes displayed on ground
- Old clothes displayed on bed
- Selling vegetables on ground
- Vegetables sold from a basket
- Vegetables sold from a lari
- Vegetables sold from a moving cart

Detail A Vending activity and space use
Alternative 1

This scheme shows a narrowed service road and a 4m pavement. There is now scope for tree-planting on the road and the provision of a water tap, and trash bin.
Alternative 2

This scheme also shows a narrowed service road and a 4m pavement, but is specifically designed to accommodate traders using a lari.
Utilities

Drinking water, a washroom, and clean toilets are basic human needs. Every market should provide these for the vendors. In addition, vendors need shade and shelter to protect them and their goods from sun, rain and dust, waste collection facilities, and storage so they do not have to carry their goods away from the market each day. Customers need good pedestrian access and parking.

6. Planning Innovations

Town planning initiatives

Normal planning procedures provide various opportunities for vending on under-used space, or the allocation of space through normal planning and zoning procedures. This chapter uses case studies to illustrate three types of planning intervention that have provided space for street vendors:

1. Use of incidental (or left-over) space
2. Allocation of vending space in housing schemes and in statutory/formal local plans and planning schemes
3. Space sharing over time (e.g. for weekly or Sunday markets)

Incidental space – identified through community-led design: Jamalpur

Jamalpur Market, Ahmedabad, is a vegetable market accommodating about 675 vendors, at the eastern end of Sardar Bridge at the junction of Bhagtacharya Road and Jamalpur Road, which are connected by a new flyover. The informal market lies outside the Sardar Patel Agricultural Produce Market Committee (APMC market), the vegetable and grain wholesale market for the district. Vendors buy in bulk from the main market and sell in smaller quantities along the street. A history of the market is outlined below.
Many attempts have been made to solve congestion problems at Jamalpur...

1975 APMC shifted to Jamalpur; wholesale market attracted a few vendors
1979 Vendor numbers increased to 90
1985 Riots – more vendors shifted to Jamalpur for safety
1996 Vendors given demarcated space under Clean City campaign by AMC
2002 AMC built platforms for vending at an open plot beside the bridge
2003 Market and security poor, so vendors shifted back to the original place
2004 SEWA form a trust for vendor members, Jamapur Vechnara Bajar Sewa Samiti
2004 AMC wanted to allot riverside space to other vendors; vendors filed a case
2006 Court passed stay order
2008 Increase of vendors due to financial crisis; SEWA regulates vendors
2008 Flyover built under JNNURM project to reduce traffic congestion at junction

Source: Research by SEWA, 2012

Many vendors were displaced by construction of the flyover, but this also created an opportunity. Led by SEWA, which has a strong membership in the market, the vendors argued that shifting the market under the flyover would reduce traffic conflicts and give them shelter. In 2011, SEWA prepared a design proposal to accommodate 249 vendors under the flyover, and negotiated with AMC for approval. The scheme is now implemented and at the time of writing was about to be occupied. The rest of the vendors would be given space near the flower market.

Source: SEWA Proposal, use of incidental space under Jamalpur bridge, Ahmedabad
Planning Innovations...ctd.

Markets identified through planning legislation

Under the Gujarat Town Planning and Urban Development Act, 1976, Town Planning Schemes must be prepared for existing and new areas. These allow for the allocation of land for housing, retailing etc. In Surat, the GTPUD has been used to allocate vending areas for convenience goods (vegetables and food items) in housing schemes, as in Saiyadpura Market below.

Saiyadpura market

Saiyadpura is primarily a meat market, catering to the local area. The market also includes a vegetable market, constructed by the Surat Municipal Corporation (SMC). SMC has provided the vendors with platforms and has constructed a semi-permanent tin roof over the whole market. SMC collects Rs. 2-3/- per day for using the space, and there is storage inside the market.
Bhatar market

At Bhatar Market, in 2011 Surat Municipal Corporation (SMC) allocated spaces for street vendors next to an SMC housing scheme. Vending times are 10:00 – 13:00 and then again 16:00 – 22:00. SMC officials visit once or twice in a month to collect monthly fees of Rs. 50/- to Rs. 100/-. Vendors can store their goods and accessories in the market itself.
Planning Innovations...ctd.

Time-sharing of space: rotating market: Bitten Market

In Bhopal, Bitten Market operates for 3 days a week on Tuesdays, Thursdays and Saturdays. On other days, vendors sell elsewhere in the town. The market is located on a large open space that is usually a playground and park. Bhopal Municipal Corporation (BMC) has provided basic facilities, including a raised platform for the market. The management arrangements include the following:

- Daily vending fee of Rs. 20/- collected by BMC
- Electricity provided by private contractor, for which vendors pay an extra Rs.20/- day
- Vending area demarcated from footpaths by different coloured paving, but with no change of level
- Seating provided on raised platforms
- Shelter provided by vendors who put up temporary shade, using plastic sheets, bamboo and rope
- Pay toilets and drinking water provided (see map)
- Space allocation for each vendor is 1.8m x 2.4m
- Vendors are not licensed.

Map showing location of Bitten Market

Different coloured tiles to demarcate space
Parking space
Temporary shade
Time-sharing of space: Sunday market, Bhopal

Also in Bhopal, the Sunday Market operates only on Sundays, when the roads are pedestrianised. Paid parking is provided nearby to support market activities. There are no structures provided. BMC collects Rs. 20/- per day from each vendor. Electricity is provided by a private service provider via generators for which Rs. 20/- per day is charged separately. These vendors sell in Bitten Market on Thursdays, Tuesdays and Saturdays. The vendors are not licensed. BMC has not allocated individual spaces for vendors, so spaces are created through informal arrangements amongst vendors.
In exceptional cases it may not be possible to accommodate street vendors on-street, and off-street provision may be the only alternative. However, it must be remembered that location is a crucial determinant of a street vendor’s income, and a move of even a few meters can drastically reduce their daily earnings. The location on pedestrian routes, and good pedestrian access are thus crucial to the success of off-street markets.

Rajkot Municipal Corporate (RMC) has designed an off-street markets, the Laxminagar Hawkers’ Zone. This is mainly vegetable market accommodating 300-350 vendors. There are some laris selling cooked food on one side, and fruit sellers stand on the road. Vendors had been hawking on the roadside for around 40 years, but were given the off-site space by RMC in around 2007. Vendors are not licenses. Vending is allowed throughout the day, but vendors mainly occupy the site in the late afternoon and evening, around 4-9pm. During the morning they vend at Chandranagar area. The vending area has the following characteristics:

- The vending area is demarcated by pathways of different coloured floor tiles and by different levels
- The space allocated to each vendor is 1.8 x 2.1 m; circulation paths are 2.4 m wide
- Pay toilets are provided
- Electricity is provided by a private company via a battery with a charge of Rs. 40/- per day
- There is a Rs. 25/- per day charge by RMC for a lari in the hawkers zone
- Plastic bags are prohibited in the hawkers zone
- Each vendor should keep dustbin otherwise he/she will be fined
- There is no parking space for customers.
APPENDIX: Design & the Law:

National Policy on Urban Street Vendors of India, 2009

In 2009, the Ministry of Housing and Urban Poverty Alleviation passed the National Policy on Urban Street Vendors of India, advised by NASVI (National Association of Street Vendors of India). The policy demonstrates how the legal context is crucial in framing design, and many of the ideas in this design guide have been developed to illustrate how the policy may be implemented. A few key ideas from the NPUSVI are highlighted in the extracts below.

Section 4.1 Spatial Planning Norms
“There is need for the master / zonal / local / layout development plans to be ‘inclusive’ and address the requirements of space for street vending as an important urban activity through norms for reservation of space for street vendors in accordance with their current population, projected growth of street vendors, based on the rate of growth in the previous five years and the average number of customers that generally visit informal markets in vending zones”.

Section 4.2 Demarcation of Vending Zones
“The demarcation of ‘Restriction - free Vending Zones’, ‘Restricted Vending Zones’ and ‘No-Vending Zones’ should be city / town specific.

a) Spatial planning should take into account the natural propensity of street vendors to locate in certain places at certain times in response to the patterns of demand for their goods/services.

b) Municipal Authorities should frame necessary rules for regulating entry of street vendors on a time sharing basis in designated vending zones

c) Municipal Authorities should allocate sufficient space for temporary ‘Vendors’ Markets’ (e.g. Weekly Haats, Rehri Markets, Night Bazaars, Festival Bazaars, Food Streets / Street Food Marts etc.) whose use at other times may be different (e.g. public park, exhibition ground, parking lot etc.).

d) Mobile vending should be permitted in all areas even outside the ‘Vendors Markets’, unless designated as ‘No-Vending Zone’ in the zonal, local area or layout plans under the master / development plan of each city / town”.

However, the use of ‘No-Vending Zones’ should be minimised as conflicts can often be resolved through inclusive design rather than an outright ban.

Section 4.4 Provision of Civic Facilities
“Municipal Authorities need to provide basic civic facilities in Vending Zones / Vendors’ Markets which would include; solid waste disposal, public toilet, electricity, drinking water, storage facilities etc.”

Street Vendors (Protection of Livelihood and Regulation of Street Vending) Bill, 2012

The proposed Bill is aimed at protecting the livelihood rights and social security of street vendors and regulation of urban street vending in the country and ensuring uniformity in the legal framework for street vending across States and Union territories.

Under Chapter II, Registration of Street Vendors:
3(1) Every person who has completed the age of fourteen years, or as the case may be, the age prescribed by the appropriate Government, and intends to do street vending, may make an application to the Town Vending Committee for registration as a street vendor.

(4) Every street vendor who has been issued certificate of vending under sub-section(1) shall be issued identity cards in such form and manner as may be specified in the scheme.

Section 9(1) Every certificate of vending shall be valid for such period as may be specified in the scheme.
Chapter III, Rights and Obligations of Street Vendors

Section 12. (1) Every street vendor shall have right to carry on the business of street vending activities in the vending zones allotted to him in accordance with the terms and conditions mentioned in the certificate of vending.

Section 13. Every street vendor, who possesses a certificate of vending, shall, in case of his relocation under section 18, be entitled for new site or area, as the case may be, for carrying out his vending activities as may be determined by the local authority.

Section 15. Every street vendor shall maintain cleanliness and public hygiene in the vending zones and the adjoining areas.

Chapter VI, Plan for Street Vending

Section 21. (1) Every local authority shall, in consultation with the Planning Authority, once in every five years, make out a plan to promote a supportive environment for the vast mass of urban street vendors to carry out their vocation.

The first schedule (street vending plan) states that

Paragraph (1) The plan shall,—
(a) Ensure that urban street vending activities do not lead to overcrowding and unsanitary conditions of public spaces, areas and streets and not impede the movement of the general public;
(b) Ensure that the provision of space or area for street vending is reasonable and consistent with existing natural markets;
(c) Take into account the civic facilities for appropriate use of identified spaces or areas as vending zones;

Paragraph (2) The plan shall contain all of the following matters, namely:—
(a) Determination of spatial planning norms for street vending;
(b) Earmarking of space or area for vending zones;
(c) Determination of vending zones as restriction-free-vending zones, restricted vending zones and no-vending zones;
(d) Making of spatial plans conducive and adequate for the prevalent number of street vendors in that city or town and also for the future growth, by adopting such norms as maybe necessary;
(e) Consequential changes needed in the existing master plan, development plan, zonal plan, layout plan and any other plan for accommodating street vendors in the designated vending zones.

Under Chapter VII, Town Vending Committee

Section 27 (2) Every Town Vending Committee shall maintain up-to-date records of registered street vendors and street vendors to whom a certificate of vending has been issued containing name of such street vendor, stall allotted to him, nature of business carried out by him, category of street vending and such other particulars which may be relevant to the street vendors, in such manner as may be prescribed.

Section (3) Every Town Vending Committee shall carry out social audit of its activities under the Act or the rules or the schemes made thereunder in such form and manner as may be specified in the scheme.